

# Comparative Analysis of US and EU Border Relations



Lydia Elsey, Aoife Whitaker, Allyna Wilson

# Outline

1. Overview
  - 1.1. History of US Border Policy
  - 1.2. History of EU Border Policy
2. Comparative Analysis
  - 2.1. Economic Conditions
  - 2.2. Cultural Conditions
  - 2.3. Physical Conditions
  - 2.4. Political Conditions
3. Current Issues
  - 3.1. US-Mexico Border Crisis
  - 3.2. Schengen Crisis
4. Future of EU and US border policy

# History of US Border Policy

- Mexico
  - Traditionally seen as an “unofficial path” for migrants who worked in the US, less strict
  - US completed the first physical wall between San Diego and Tijuana in 1993
  - Today, the southern border has become one of the most significant issues in the US
- Canada
  - Establishment of the border dates back to the Treaty of Paris and ends with the Treaty of 1908
  - Between 9/11 and today border personnel has increased from about 350 to over 2,000
  - Border still remains fairly relaxed
- Non-physical borders
  - Soon after 9/11, the federal government tightened the process of issuing temporary visas to tourists, business visitors, and students
  - Department of Homeland Security (DHS) was introduced
    - They provide screening, collecting data on international travelers, interview people of certain nationalities, and share information with other countries

# History of EU Border Policy

Internal Border Policies	External Border Policies
<p data-bbox="175 410 614 459">Schengen Agreement</p> <ul data-bbox="198 495 855 773" style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="198 495 855 543">● Tradition of Free Movement</li><li data-bbox="198 580 855 689">● France and Germany as pioneers</li><li data-bbox="198 726 855 773">● Created the Schengen Area</li></ul>	<p data-bbox="950 410 1392 459">Treaty of Amsterdam</p> <ul data-bbox="973 495 1686 991" style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="973 495 1686 543">● Schengen Borders Code</li><li data-bbox="973 580 1686 689">● Internal Security Fund: Borders and Visa</li><li data-bbox="973 726 1686 834">● Centralized Databases with the Dublin Regulation</li><li data-bbox="973 871 1686 919">● Facilitators Package</li><li data-bbox="973 956 1686 991">● Frontex</li></ul>

# Comparative Analysis

# Comparative Analysis: Economic Conditions

United States	European Union
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Status of economies of US, Canada, and Mexico with regards to NAFTA</li><li>● Effects of mexican immigration</li><li>● Costs of border protection</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Economic requirements for entering states</li><li>● Migration effects</li><li>● Costs of border protection</li></ul>

# Comparative Analysis: Cultural Conditions

United States	European Union
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● External borders were created to be exclusionary</li><li>● US “melting pot”</li><li>● Current US presidential administration</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● EU borders were created to be inclusive</li><li>● Similar European identity but emphasis on diversity</li></ul> <p>“The suppression of internal borders of the <u>European Union</u> is recognition that all the citizens of the states concerned belong to the same space, that they share a common identity.”</p>



**Donald J. Trump** ✓

@realDonaldTrump

Follow



We need the Wall for the safety and security of our country. We need the Wall to help stop the massive inflow of drugs from Mexico, now rated the number one most dangerous country in the world. If there is no Wall, there is no Deal!



**Donald J. Trump** ✓

@realDonaldTrump

Following



For those who want and advocate for illegal immigration, just take a good look at what has happened to Europe over the last 5 years. A total mess! They only wish they had that decision to make over again.



# Comparative Analysis: Political Conditions

United States	European Union
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• US border policy is dependent on presidential administration and political party power</li><li>• Debates on external border policies are largely polarized</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• EU border policy is dependent upon joint efforts from the EU and member states</li><li>• Dublin Agreement</li><li>• Schengen Border Code</li></ul>

# Comparative Analysis: Physical Conditions

## United States

### Mexican Border

- Physical barrier guarded with intense border control (>20,000 agents)
- Used to keep out drugs and crime, undocumented migrants, and terrorism
- Different culture, economy, way of life
- Border runs between California, Arizona, Texas, and New Mexico

### Canadian Border

- Border wasn't much of a concern until 9/11
- Prevention of drug smuggling, terrorism, illegal crossings

## European Union

### External Border

- Used to keep out terrorism and crime
- Used to safeguard the free movement of people in Schengen
- Some member states have implemented physical borders

### Internal Border

- Schengen Area
- Schengen border code - 2015 refugee crisis affected the rules of Schengen

## Canadian Border



## Mexican Border



# US-Mexico Border Crisis

## Presidential Reforms Regarding the Mexican/American Border

- Bush- 2006 Secure Fence Act
- Obama - DACA (2012)
- Trump - The wall

## The “Crisis”

- After 9/11 newspapers and politicians started a rhetoric of the border based on fear
- The number of illegal border crossings are the lowest they have been in decades
- Illegal drugs mostly pass through legal ports of entry, rather than unguarded parts
- Humanitarian Crisis

# Family Separation 2018



# Schengen Crisis

## Migration and Refugee Crisis

- 18 April 2015: A boat with up to 700 migrants on board capsized in the Mediterranean Sea
  - highest death toll from a shipwreck during the migrant crisis
- In 2015 over one million migrants entered Europe
- 2016 EU-Turkey Deal
- Reinstitution of border controls

## Terrorist Crisis

- Terrorist attacks in Europe since 2015
- French authorities have cited terrorism in their reasoning for the reinstatement of border checks

# Future of US and EU Border Policy

United States	European Union
Externally Focused Future	Internally Focused Future
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Main priority land borders</li><li>● Technological improvements</li><li>● Review of current immigration standards</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Current Opinions Towards the Schengen Agreement</li><li>● The Potential Removal of the Schengen Area and Its Effects</li><li>● Work as a Union to solve external issues after solving internal problems</li></ul>